



# Computing generalized ham-sandwich cuts <sup>☆</sup>

Sergey Bereg

Department of Computer Science, University of Texas at Dallas, Box 830688, Richardson, TX 75083, USA

## ARTICLE INFO

### Article history:

Received 24 August 2011

Received in revised form 11 March 2012

Accepted 15 March 2012

Available online 19 March 2012

Communicated by F.Y.L. Chin

### Keywords:

Computational geometry

Ham-sandwich theorem

## ABSTRACT

Bárány et al. (2008) [1] proved that, for any  $\beta \in [0, 1]^d$  and any  $d$  well-separated convex bodies  $S_1, S_2, \dots, S_d$  in  $\mathbb{R}^d$ , there exists a hyperplane (a generalized ham-sandwich cut) splitting the volume of  $S_i$  as  $(\beta_i, 1 - \beta_i)$  for all  $i$ . Steiger and Zhao (2010) [4] proved a discrete analogue for  $n$  points in weak general position. The (elegant!) proof inspired an algorithm for computing this hyperplane (Steiger and Zhao, 2010 [4]) with running time  $O(n \log^{d-3} n)$  for  $d \geq 3$  and  $O(n)$  for  $d = 2$ . In this note we show that their algorithm can be modified to compute a generalized ham-sandwich cut in linear time for any fixed  $d$ .

© 2012 Elsevier B.V. All rights reserved.

## 1. Introduction

Given  $d$  convex bodies in  $\mathbb{R}^d$ , a ham-sandwich cut is a hyperplane that cuts off half of the volume of each convex body. What if we wish to slice different portions of the bodies? Bárány et al. [1] found a sufficient condition for the existence of such a cut.

**Definition 1.** (See [3].) Given  $k \leq d + 1$ , a family  $S_1, \dots, S_k$  of connected sets in  $\mathbb{R}^d$  is *well separated* if, for every choice of  $x_i \in S_i$ , the affine hull of  $x_1, \dots, x_k$  is a  $(k - 1)$ -dimensional flat in  $\mathbb{R}^d$ .

**Theorem 2** (Bárány et al.). (See [1].) Let  $K_1, \dots, K_d$  be well-separated convex bodies in  $\mathbb{R}^d$ , and let  $\beta_1, \dots, \beta_d$  given constants with  $0 \leq \beta_i \leq 1$ . Then there is a unique hyperplane  $h$  such that  $\text{Vol}(K_i \cap h^+) = \beta_i \cdot \text{Vol}(K_i)$  for all  $i$ . By  $h^+$  we assume the positive closed halfspace determined by  $h$ .

Steiger and Zhao [4] studied a discrete version of the problem where convex bodies are replaced by points.

**Definition 3.** (See [4].) Points in  $S = P_1 \cup \dots \cup P_d$  are *well separated* if their convex hulls  $\text{Conv}(P_1), \dots, \text{Conv}(P_d)$  are well separated.

**Definition 4.** (See [4].) Points in  $S = P_1 \cup \dots \cup P_d$  are in *weak general position* if, for each  $(x_1, \dots, x_d)$ ,  $x_i \in P_i$ , the affine hull of  $x_1, \dots, x_d$  is a  $(d - 1)$ -dimensional flat that contains no other point of  $S$ .

**Definition 5.** (See [4].) Given positive integers  $a_i \leq |P_i|$ , an  $(a_1, \dots, a_d)$ -cut is a hyperplane  $h$  such that  $h \cap P_i \neq \emptyset$  and  $|h^+ \cap P_i| = a_i$ ,  $1 \leq i \leq d$ .

**Theorem 6** (Steiger and Zhao). (See [4].) If  $P_1, \dots, P_d$  are well-separated point sets in  $\mathbb{R}^d$ , and  $a_1, \dots, a_d$  are positive integers,  $a_i \leq |P_i|$ , then

- (i) if an  $(a_1, \dots, a_d)$ -cut exists, it is unique. Also,
- (ii) if the points are in weak general position, then a cut exists for every  $a_1, \dots, a_d$ ,  $1 \leq a_i \leq |P_i|$ .

Steiger and Zhao [4] also found an efficient algorithm for computing generalized ham-sandwich cuts for points. Let  $n = \sum |P_i|$  be the total number of points. An  $(a_1, \dots, a_d)$ -cut can be found in time  $O(n \log^{d-3} n)$ ,  $d \geq 3$ , and in linear time if  $d = 2$ . The running time exceeds linear bound if  $d \geq 4$ . Steiger and Zhao made a remark: “We

<sup>☆</sup> This research has been partially supported by project FEDER MEC MTM2009-08652.

E-mail address: [besp@utdallas.edu](mailto:besp@utdallas.edu).

tried to find a way to do the inductive step in constant time, similar to the way Lo et al. [9] did for separated ham-sandwich cuts in  $\mathbb{R}^3$ , but we did not succeed. A main open question is whether there is an  $O(n)$  algorithm for this problem.” In this note we answer their question in the affirmative.

**Theorem 7.** *Let  $P$  be any set of  $n$  points in weak general position in  $\mathbb{R}^d$ . For any partition of  $P$  into well-separated finite point sets  $P_1, \dots, P_d$  in  $\mathbb{R}^d$  and any positive integers  $a_i \leq |P_i|$ , an  $(a_1, \dots, a_d)$ -cut exists and can be found in linear time.*

Our algorithm is a modification of the algorithm by Steiger and Zhao [4] which uses a prune-and-search approach. The main difference is that the pruning step may alternate dimensions.

## 2. Linear time algorithm

We briefly describe the algorithm by Steiger and Zhao [4] for computing a generalized ham-sandwich cut. The algorithm reduces the  $d$ -dimensional problem to a constant number of  $(d - 1)$ -dimensional problems by repeating  $O(\log n)$  pruning steps. The pruning step removes a portion of points in the first set  $P_1$ . Only a constant number of points remain in  $P_1$  after pruning. Suppose that we want to compute an  $(a'_1, a_2, a_3, \dots, a_d)$ -cut after pruning  $P_1$ . For each remaining point  $p$  in  $P_1$ , the algorithm

- (i) projects sets  $P_2, P_3, \dots, P_d$  onto a hyperplane separating  $P_1$  from them (using the projection from  $p$ ),
- (ii) computes an  $(a_2, a_3, \dots)$ -cut for the projected sets in the  $(d - 1)$ -dimensional space, and
- (iii) computes the hyperplane spanning the cut from (ii) and  $p$ .

Then the running time  $T_d(n)$  of the  $d$ -dimensional problem satisfies the recurrence

$$T_d(n) = O(n) + O(\log n) \cdot T_{d-1}(n).$$

It results in  $T_d(n) = O(n \log^{d-3} n)$  for  $d \geq 3$  and  $O(n)$  for  $d = 2$  since linear time algorithms for computing ham-sandwich cuts in two and three dimensions can be adapted to generalized cuts.

### 2.1. Pruning

The pruning step is based on an  $\varepsilon$ -approximation of  $P_1$ . For a finite set of points  $S$  in  $\mathbb{R}^d$  and the set of all halfspaces in  $\mathbb{R}^d$ , the range space  $(S, H)$  has VC dimension  $d + 1$  [2]. An  $\varepsilon$ -approximation of  $(S, H)$  is a set  $A$  of points in  $\mathbb{R}^d$  such that, for any halfspace  $h' \in H$ ,

$$\left| \frac{|h' \cap S|}{|S|} - \frac{|h' \cap A|}{|A|} \right| \leq \varepsilon. \tag{1}$$

By [2], an  $\varepsilon$ -approximation  $A \subset P_1$  of  $(P_1, H)$  of constant size can be constructed in  $O(|P_1|)$  time. To be more precise,  $|A| = O(\frac{d+1}{\varepsilon^2} \log \frac{d+1}{\varepsilon})$  and the running time for computing  $A$  is  $O((d + 1)^{3(d+1)} (\frac{d+1}{\varepsilon^2} \log \frac{d+1}{\varepsilon})^{d+1} |P_1|)$ .

The pruning step copies  $P_1$  to a set  $C$  and is repeated until  $C$  contains at most  $c$  points, where  $c$  is a small constant. The number of steps is  $O(\log n)$ .

We modify the algorithm so that the set for pruning is not fixed but is selected as the largest set in  $\{P_1, P_2, \dots, P_d\}$ . In order to prune this way, we first copy sets into new sets  $Q_1, Q_2, \dots, Q_d$  and copy the parameters  $a_i$  of the cut into an array  $b_1, b_2, \dots, b_d$ . Coefficient  $b_i$  is adjusted after the pruning step where  $Q_i$  is pruned. After all pruning steps, each of the sets  $Q_1, Q_2, \dots, Q_d$  is small, i.e.  $|Q_1|, |Q_2|, \dots, |Q_d| \leq c$  for some constant  $c$ , and we compute a  $(b_1, b_2, \dots, b_d)$ -cut using a brute-force search. The correctness of the modified algorithm follows from the correctness of the pruning in the algorithm by Steiger and Zhao [4]. We describe the pseudo-code for completeness.

---

### Algorithm 1: GEN CUT( $P_1, \dots, P_d, a_1, \dots, a_d$ ).

---

```

step 1 Let  $c$  be a small integer constant.
for  $i \leftarrow 1$  to  $d$  do
     $Q_i \leftarrow P_i$ 
     $b_i \leftarrow a_i$ 
    Find a hyperplane  $\pi_i$  that separates  $P_i$  from
     $P_1 \cup \dots \cup P_{i-1} \cup P_{i+1} \cup \dots \cup P_d$ .
while  $|Q_i| > c$  for some  $i$  do
step 2 Find  $i$  such that  $|Q_i| = \max_j |Q_j|$ .
    Construct  $A$ , an  $\varepsilon$ -approximation of  $Q_i$ .
step 3 foreach  $x \in A$  do
    (a) for  $j \leftarrow 1$  to  $d$  do
        if  $j \neq i$  then
            Compute the projection of  $Q_j$  onto  $\pi_i$ .
    (b) Find the  $(b_1, \dots, b_{i-1}, b_{i+1}, \dots, b_d)$ -cut  $\rho_x$  in  $\pi_i$  for
        sets  $Q_1, \dots, Q_{i-1}, Q_{i+1}, \dots, Q_d$  by solving a
         $(d - 1)$ -dimensional problem.
    (c) Compute  $h_x$ , the hyperplane that spans  $x$  and  $\rho_x$ .
    (d) Compute  $n_x$ , the number of points of  $Q_i$  in the
        positive transversal halfspace  $h_x^+$ .
        Prune points from  $Q_i$  and adjust  $b_i$ .
step 4 Find the  $(b_1, \dots, b_d)$ -cut  $\pi$  for sets  $Q_1, \dots, Q_d$  by
    enumerating all  $d$ -tuples  $(q_1, \dots, q_d), q_i \in Q_i$ .
return  $\pi$ 

```

---

### 2.2. Running time analysis

We assume that dimension  $d$  is a constant. Let  $T_d(n)$  be the running time for computing a cut for  $n$  points in  $d$  dimensions. Step 1, Steps 3a, c, d and the pruning after the loop (Step 3) take  $O(n)$  time. Set  $A$  of constant size is constructed in Step 2 in  $O(|Q_i|)$  time. Step 3b takes  $O(T_{d-1}(n - |Q_i|))$  time. Step 4 takes  $O(c^d) = O(1)$  time. Let  $Q'_i$  be the pruned set of  $Q_i$  in the iteration of the while loop, i.e.  $Q'_i$  is set  $Q_i$  in the next iteration. Then

$$T_d(n) = \begin{cases} |A| \cdot T_{d-1}(n - |Q_i|) + T_d(n - |Q_i| + |Q'_i|) \\ \quad + O(n) & \text{if } |Q_i| = \max_j |Q_j| > c, \\ O(1) & \text{otherwise.} \end{cases}$$

A linear bound for  $T_d(n)$  follows from the following lemma.

**Lemma 8.** *For any  $d \geq 2$ , there exists a constant  $c_d$  such that  $T_d(n) \leq c_d n$  for all  $n \geq 1$ .*

**Proof.** We prove the lemma by induction on  $d$ . We assume that  $T_d(n) \leq C_d n$  for some constant  $C_d$  and  $n \leq cd$ . This covers the base case in Step 4.

Consider the inductive step. Suppose that  $d \geq 3$  and  $\varepsilon = 1/3$ . We have

$$|Q_i| \geq \frac{n}{d} \quad \text{and} \quad n - |Q_i| \leq \frac{d-1}{d}n.$$

Next, we bound  $|Q'_i|$  from below.  $|A|$  hyperplanes constructed in Step 3b split  $Q_i$  into  $|A| + 1$  sets. Only one of these sets,  $Q'_i$ , will survive. Suppose that  $Q'_i = h_x^+ - h_y^+$  where  $h_x^+$  and  $h_y^+$  are closed halfspaces determined by hyperplanes  $h_x$  and  $h_y$ , respectively. Note that  $h_x^+ \cap A = h_y^+ \cap A$ . Let  $a = |h_x^+ \cap A|/|A|$ . Since  $A$  is an  $\varepsilon$ -approximation of  $(Q_i, H)$  [4], by inequality (1)

$$\left| \frac{|h_x^+ \cap Q_i|}{|Q_i|} - a \right| \leq \varepsilon \quad \text{and} \quad \left| \frac{|h_y^+ \cap Q_i|}{|Q_i|} - a \right| \leq \varepsilon.$$

Then

$$\frac{|Q'_i|}{|Q_i|} = \left| \frac{|h_x^+ \cap Q_i|}{|Q_i|} - \frac{|h_y^+ \cap Q_i|}{|Q_i|} \right| \leq 2\varepsilon = \frac{2}{3}.$$

Then

$$|Q_i| - |Q'_i| \geq |Q_i| - \frac{2}{3}|Q_i| = |Q_i|/3 \geq \frac{n}{3d}.$$

The last term in the recurrence for  $T_d(n)$  can be bounded from above by  $c'_d n$  for some constant  $c'_d$ . Then

$$\begin{aligned} T_d(n) &\leq |A| \cdot T_{d-1}\left(\frac{d-1}{d}n\right) + T_d\left(n - \frac{n}{3d}\right) + c'_d n \\ &\leq |A| \cdot c_{d-1} \frac{d-1}{d}n + c_d \left(n - \frac{n}{3d}\right) + c'_d n \\ &\leq c_d n + \left(|A| \cdot c_{d-1} \frac{d-1}{d} + c'_d - \frac{c_d}{3d}\right)n \leq c_d n \end{aligned}$$

if  $c_d \geq 3(d-1)|A| \cdot c_{d-1} + 3dc'_d$ . The lemma follows if we choose  $c_d = \max(C_d, 4(d-1) \cdot |A| \cdot c_{d-1} + 3dc'_d)$ .  $\square$

This completes the proof of Theorem 7.

## References

- [1] I. Bárány, A. Hubard, J. Jerónimo, Slicing convex sets and measures by a hyperplane, *Discrete Comput. Geom.* 39 (1–3) (2008) 65–75.
- [2] B. Chazelle, *The Discrepancy Method: Randomness and Complexity*, Cambridge University Press, 2000.
- [3] H. Kramer, A. Nemeth, Supporting spheres for families of independent convex sets, *Arch. Math.* 24 (1973) 91–96.
- [4] W. Steiger, J. Zhao, Generalized ham-sandwich cuts, *Discrete Comput. Geom.* 44 (3) (2010) 535–545.